## FEDERAL MINE SAFETY AND HEALTH REVIEW COMMISSION

1331 PENNSYLVANIA AVENUE, NW, SUITE 520N WASHINGTON, D.C. 20004-1710

OCT 1 9 2017

SECRETARY OF LABOR,
MINE SAFETY AND HEALTH

ADMINISTRATION (MSHA)

v. : Docket Nos. KENT 2012-749

KENT 2012-904 KENT 2012-1085

.

NALLY & HAMILTON ENTERPRISES,

INC.

BEFORE: Althen, Acting Chairman; Jordan, Young, and Cohen, Commissioners

## **DECISION**

## BY THE COMMISSION:

These proceedings arise under the Federal Mine Safety and Health Act of 1977, 30 U.S.C. § 801 et. seq. (2012) for violations of 30 C.F.R. § 77.1001 and 30 C.F.R. § 77.1713(a). At issue is whether substantial evidence supports determinations made by the Judge in overturning "significant and substantial" ("S&S") designations accompanying a citation and order issued to Nally & Hamilton Enterprises, Inc. by the Department of Labor's Mine Safety and Health Administration.

Acting Chairman Althen and Commissioner Young vote to affirm the Judge's decision, while Commissioner Jordan and Commissioner Cohen vote to reverse the Judge's decision. The effect of the split decision is to allow the Judge's decision to stand as if affirmed. *Pennsylvania Elec. Co.*, 12 FMSHRC 1562 (Aug. 1990), *aff'd on other grounds*, 969 F.2d 1501 (3d Cir. 1992).

William I. Althen, Acting Chairman

Mary Lu Jadan, Commissioner

Mignael G. Young, Commissioner

Robert F. Cohen, Jr., Commissioner

## Distribution

Billy R. Shelton, Esq. Jones, Walters, Turner & Shelton PLLC 151 N. Eagle Creek Drive, Suite 310 Lexington, KY 40509

S. Thomas Hamilton, Esq. Saltsman & Willett, P.S.C. P.O. Box 327 212 East Stephen Foster Ave. Bardstown, KY 40004

Edward Waldman, Esq.
U.S. Department of Labor
Office of the Solicitor
201 12<sup>th</sup> Street-South, Suite 401
Arlington, VA 22202-5450
Waldman.edward@dol.gov

Ali A. Beydoun, Esq.
Office of the Solicitor
US Department of Labor
201 12th St. South-Suite 401
Arlington, VA 22202-5450

Melanie Garris Office of Civil Penalty Compliance, MSHA U.S. Department of Labor 201 12th Street South, Suite 401 Arlington, VA 22202-5450

Administrative Law Judge John Lewis Federal Mine Safety Health Review Commission 875 Green Tree Road, 7 Parkway Center, Suite 290 Pittsburgh, PA 15220